

High Hallim and Passing Dreams: A Critical Analysis of James Gale's 1922 translation
of Kim Man-chung's (1687) *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*

Principal Researcher: Michael Sean Gallagher, Assistant Professor, Hankuk University of
Foreign Studies, Department of English Interpretation and Translation.

107, Imun-ro, Dongdaemun-gu, Seoul, Republic of Korea, 130-791.

gallagher.michaelsean@gmail.com

+82 10 9901 4066

Co-authors: Lee, Soo-hyun; Lim, Hyo-won; Noh, Song-eun; Park, Dawon; Song, Min-
soo. Hankuk University of Foreign Studies. 107, Imun-ro, Dongdaemun-gu, Seoul,
Republic of Korea, 130-791.

May 25, 2014

High Hallim and Passing Dreams: A Critical Analysis of James Gale's 1922 translation
of Kim Man-chung's *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*

High Hallim and Passing Dreams: A Critical Analysis of James Gale's 1922 translation of Kim Man-chung's *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*

Abstract

The Cloud Dream of the Nine, a popular and revered piece of Korean literature, was written by Kim Man-chung during the middle period of the Chosun Dynasty (1392-1910). It is essentially a morality tale charting the journey of Master Yang through trials and enlightenment. It reveals the dynamism of philosophy and religion circulating through Korean society at that time, a heady mix of Buddhist, Confucian, and Taoist thought. A record of emotions, insights, and ambitions is shown as Yang navigates his life journey and achieves an enlightened state amidst the Buddhist, Confucian, and Taoist interactions. *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* is a fantastical and potentially perilous piece of literature for those interested in maintaining the fidelity of Asian literature.

It is also one of the first Korean texts of significance to be translated into English, having been done so by James Gale (1922). This translation remains the definitive work despite the conscious omission of much of the structure, nuance, and sophistication of Kim Man-chung's original text. Gale's translation is a respectful work concerned with readability over a strict cultural, structural, and linguistic fidelity. In this paper, we critique Gale's translation strategies as made visible through three representative passages from the Korean text and discuss the need for a new translation effort, one that attempts to provide a more sophisticated cultural setting in which to explore the nuances of Chosun Korea's philosophy, religion, and literature. We believe that audiences today are sophisticated enough to begin to grapple with the sophistication of the original text.

Keywords

Literature, Cloud Dream of the Nine, translation, classical, Confucian

Introduction

The Cloud Dream of the Nine, a seminal piece of Korean literature, was one of the first Korean texts of any significance to be translated into English. This Korean classic is more than a morality tale of Master Yang and his eight women as it also reveals several cultural aspects of Korea through a delicate navigation of Buddhist and Confucian traditions. It also provides a metaphorical exploration of the desires of man. In this tale, we see a young talented acolyte (Song-jin) who cannot extinguish his yearning for worldly delights after his visit to the Dragon King and thus is condemned by his teacher to Hell. The Lord of the Netherworld sends him back to the world of the living and Song-jin is reborn as Yang. A record of emotions, insights, and ambitions is shown as Yang navigates his life journey and encounters the eight women along the way. *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* is a heady, fantastical, and potentially perilous piece of literature for those interested in the cultural and structural fidelity of translation of literature.

In 1922, Dr. James Gale—a Canadian missionary who demonstrated an uncommon respect for Korean literature and culture as well as an equally uncommon capacity for translating it—translated *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* into English. Gale represents one of the first conduits to the West of the Korean culture as he devoted himself to the first Korean-English dictionary, a translation of the Bible and countless other materials. Through Gale the story of Yang is translated simply and clearly; unlike the other Korean translation (2003) used in this paper he does not do justice to the literary form yet he embedded the mind and the manner of the Eastern culture in his work. In short, Gale attempted a fidelity to the Korean cultural structure at the expense of a fidelity to the

literary form. This was partly due to the Western audience he was translating for, an audience, presumably, unfamiliar with the nuance of Buddhist and Confucian tradition.

In this paper, we will be discussing the quality of the 2003 Minumsa Korean version of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* to the 1922 version translated by James Gale, considered a classic of Korean-English translation. This comparison is based on the translation strategies used by Gale and the cultural details used in the translation. We will be analysing the quality of this translation through three passages and the translation techniques used in the translation. Please note that we will not be referring to the more popular English translation of Richard Rutt (1974). Ultimately, we conclude by suggesting a new translation effort be initiated, one that embraces the cultural nuance of the original text for an English audience with greater familiarity with Buddhist and Confucian tradition.

Review of Literature

Despite being the oldest known English translation, James Gale's 1922 translation of Kim Man-chung's classic remains the seminal translation of this literary classic in English. The translated classic has drawn much attention from researchers for its accessible allegorical content and for its faithful presentation of the Korean mind to Western audiences. Gale drew from several sources for his translation, none more important than Chinese literary tradition.

Much research has been directed towards understanding the Chinese influence on Korean literature, including *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* (Bao-Jong, 2005 & Li et al, 2005). It is a heady mix of both Chinese and Korean influences so this research is useful for providing a cultural context for translation. For James Gale, an understanding of the

Chinese and Korean influences on the novel, where they overlap and where they differ, would have been useful as he undertook the translation in 1922. Much research has been directed towards Gale's capacity for understanding the particular details of the Korean mentality (Baek, 1993). To present the Korean mentality with such accuracy, Gale would have needed to be familiar with the Chinese and Korean texts that influenced the creation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*. As evidence of this awareness, Gale wrote directly about the influence of the Chinese on Korean literature (1900).

Of great value to Gale would have been the earlier work performed by Westerners living in Korea in the 19th century, which Gale would have presumably used as source work. These works range from brief texts on the nature of the Korean language with some rudimentary translations into German (Gutzlaff, 1833 & Braesel, 2002), as well later studies in Korean etymology (Jones, 1892) and the Korean alphabet (Hulbert, 1892). These works were not limited to non-Koreans; indeed, one of the source materials listed by Underwood (1931) in his review of Korean literature is Yi Ik-Seup's *The Alphabet* (Pancul) written in 1892. Gale himself collaborated with several Korean linguists on his own work on Korean grammar (1894). These language developments are best represented by the dictionary of the Korean language credited to Gale, Horace Underwood, and Homer Hulbert (1890), both contemporaries of Gale in the Seoul missionary and diplomatic community. At this time, there was a large amount of materials on the Korean language being generated by this small community, all of which would have been used by Gale in his translation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* in 1922.

Of interest to the translator is the potential effect that Gale's profession as a missionary had on his 1922 translation. Much of the attitudes of these Protestant

missionaries towards the Korean language and literature can be captured in the texts generated by the missionaries (Silva, 2002). These include missionary texts generated by Gale himself (Gale, 1912). There has been research analyzing the effect of Protestant missionary work on Korean education at all levels, particularly higher education (Kang, 2012). There was also work by the Protestant missionaries on translating Korean classics, formalizing spellings and phrases through the generation of Korean-English dictionaries, and these effects on modernizing the Korean language in the early part of the 20th century (King, 2004). Not only were Korean-English dictionaries developed and these classics translated and made available to English audiences, but also these early Protestant missionaries developed systematic indexes of Korean literature. For example, Horace Underwood's 1931 *Occidental Literature on Korea* being invaluable for research of the period. There is little evidence that Gale's position as a missionary negatively influenced his view of the Korean language and literature. Much of this respect for the Korean language is evident in *The Korean Alphabet* (1912), where Gale speaks of the origins of the Korean alphabet in comparison to other Western languages, noting its great simplicity of form and intent. In the 1922 translation we discuss here, Gale is very respectful of both the Korean culture and the Korean linguistic structure in which that culture is transmitted.

Therefore, it can be said that James Gale was an important member of a community of linguists, translators, interpreters, and writers. His own work is prolific and provides a mechanism for understanding his 1922 translation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* as one representative example in a long legacy of sound translations of previously inaccessible Korean texts. Some representative works include *Korean Sketches* (1898), his later *History of the Korean People* (1927), and a number of translations and critical

works on Korean literature (1918). Gale moved between a wide range of topics including folk tales (2008), bible study (1912), histories (1927) and grammatical texts (1912). Gale was influenced by a community of missionaries, as well as by scholars and writers. Much of this work and this interaction with these communities influenced the 1922 translation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*. It is the foundation from which he drew the fidelity of the translation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*.

Analysis

In this paper, we will be analyzing three passages to compare the quality of Gale's 1922 translation to the original Korean text as illustrated in the 2003 Minumsa Korean edition. It should be noted that the 2003 Korean version is a compilation of the two oldest known versions of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* in the Korean and Chinese languages (2003). This 2003 version used these two oldest versions as its source material as there continues to be speculation over whether the original text was written in the Chinese or Korean language (McGreal, 1996). However, it should be noted that the oldest known Chinese and Korean versions have passages that do not exist in the other. Therefore, the 2003 version that we are using as a comparison is a compilation of two different texts and not a direct equivalent to Gale's 1922 version. Furthermore, we do not know the source text of the Gale 1922 translation, nor whether he was compiling from both the Chinese and Korean versions. We assume that he was working with older versions of the text, perhaps the same versions being used to compile the 2003 Korean version. However, this is merely speculation.

The following three passages present the original Korean text as referenced in the 2003 Minumsa Korean version followed by the 1922 Gale translation. These passages are followed by the Gale translated text and are then followed by our analysis of the quality of the translation and the methods used.

Passage #1

“남자가 세상에 나서 어려서는 공맹(孔孟)의 글을 읽고 자라서는 요순(堯舜) 같은 임금을 만나, 나면 장수 되고 들면 정승이 되어 비단옷을 입고 옥대를 두르고 궁궐에 조회하고 눈으로 고운 색을 보고 귀로 좋은 소리를 듣고 은택(恩澤)이 백성에게 미치고 공명(功名)을 후세에 전함이 또한 대장부의 일이라. 우리 부처의 법문은 한 바리 밥과 한 병 물과 두어 권 경문과 일백여덟 개 염주뿐이라. 도가 비록 높고 아름다우나 적막하기 심하도다.” (2003)

Target text: "If one study diligently the Confucian classics," said the tempter to him, "one may become a General or a Minister of State, one may dress in silk and bow before the King and dispense favours among the people. One can look on beautiful things with the eyes and hear delightful sounds with the ears, whereas we Buddhists have only our little dish of rice and spare flask of water, many dry books to learn and our beads to say over till we are old and grey. The vacant longings that are never satisfied are too deep to express. When once the spirit and soul dissipate into smoke and nothingness, who will ever know that a person called Song-jin lived upon this earth?"

This is a remarkably vivid passage in its own right, but one that needs to be contextualized in the currents of Korean society in the middle Chosun Dynasty (1392-1910). *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* was published in the middle, mature period of the Chosun Dynasty (1687) when a large variety of religious, philosophical, and artistic approaches were flourishing throughout Korean society and the tributary relations with China were fully institutionalized (Kwak, T., & Joo, S., 2003), providing a steady conduit of Chinese influence on Korean society. *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* portrayed these times and reflected the coexistence of Confucianism, Buddhism, and Taoism. It describes the life of a successful man in a nominally Confucian society, one who heroically journeys through despair to achieve a sense of (Buddhist) enlightenment. This story suggests an inner conflict between the doctrine of Buddhism and Confucian values in Korean society. It is essentially a morality tale for the period, but one that fuses seemingly incompatible belief systems and does so convincingly.

Gale (1922) presented a broad translation in this paragraph to make Western readers understand, or at least provide access to, the complexity of these religious concepts. Gale's translation strategy in this passage gave greater emphasis to readability as opposed to strict fidelity of this Buddhist & Confucian fusion of ideas and activities. However, there is much more to this passage in Korean than is presented in the English text. The source text started with the subject of 'a man' which suggests and is consistent with the phallocentrism of Confucian society but Gale substituted the subject to 'one' which covers both genders neutrally. Gale perhaps is alluding here to a greater humanity, but this is inconsistent with the Korean text. There are further examples of this type of

substitution throughout the passage. Instead of giving a word-for-word translation, Gale presents the premise that ‘if one studies Confucian classics’ to establish the background for readers. However, this broadening to ‘Confucian classics’ betrays the nuance of the original passage. Gale further refers to ‘Confucius and Mencius’ as ‘Confucian classics.’ Important symbolic distinctions are effectively lost in this translation, such as ‘the King Yo and Soon’ who stand for the reign of peace in ancient China; this has been rendered in the Gale translation as simply ‘the king’, which indicates only a general meaning of rank, rather than peace and prosperity. Gale doesn't provide further explanation as to the symbolic importance of these details, an importance that is very present in the Korean text.

His translation strategy, with an admirable emphasis on accessibility and readability particularly for Western audiences, fails to deliver the cultural context from the source text. Because the book was published in the middle period of the Chosun Dynasty, it included many Chinese characters, which are difficult to render into English, which perhaps influenced the Gale translation. So Gale’s translation doesn’t deliver the cultural context and implications that the original texts conveyed, especially in reference to the male-dominated society and Confucian ideas and values. It discards these details for the sake of readability.

Passage #2

양생이 이 말을 듣고 기쁜 빛이 낮에 가득하여 사례했다.

"양소유 소저의 청안으로 돌아봄을 얻으니 죽도록 이 은덕을 어찌 잊으리오.

소생은 초 사람이라 집에 노모 계시니 화축의 예는 양가 부모께 고하여

행하려니와 혼인 언약은 이제 지금 한마디로 정할 것이니 화산의 길이 푸르고
위수 끊어지지 아니하였나이다."

유랑이 또한 소매에서 아주 작은 종이 봉한 것을 내어주거늘 양생이 떼어 보니
양류사 한 수라. 내용은 다음과 같았다.

누각 앞에 버들을 심었으니
낭군의 말을 메어 머물게 하려 했더니
어찌 꺾어 채를 만들어
재촉하여 장대 길로 가려 하나뇨.

양생이 본 후, 그 글의 맑고 새로우며 완곡함을 크게 감탄하여 칭찬하며 말하되,
비록 옛날 시를 잘 하던 왕우승과 최학사라도 이보다 낫다 하지 못하리로다."
하고, 즉시 화전을 떨치고 한 수를 지어 유랑에게 주니 그 글의 내용은 다음과
같았다.

버들이 천만 가지나 하니
가지가지마다 마음이 구비구비 맺혔도다
원컨대 달 아래 노끈을 만들어
봄소식을 전하고자 하노라 (2003)

Target Text: When So-yoo heard this he was greatly interested, as his countenance showed. He thanked her, and said: "My name is Yang So-yoo, and my home is in the land of Cho. I am young and not yet married. Only my aged mother is alive, and while the marriage question is one that will need inquiry on the part of both our clans, still consent to the contract may be given even here and now, and so for my part I consent at once, and swear it by the long green hills of Wha-san and the endless reaches of the Wee-soo River."

The nurse, delighted at her success, took a letter from her sleeve, gave it to So-yoo, who tore it open and found a poem which read:

"Willows waving by the way, Bade my lord his course to stay, He, alas, has failed to ken, Draws his whip and rides again."

When So-yoo had read the verse and noted its brightness and freshness, he praised it, saying: "No ancient sage ever wrote more sweetly." Then he unrolled a sheet of watered paper and wrote his reply thus:

"Willow catkins soft and dear, Bid thy soul to never fear, Ever may they bind us true, You to me, and me to you."

The above passage depicts a rich exchange between the main character and a female attendant to a principal character, an exchange of poetry consistent with the high society of the Chosun Dynasty. Gale's 1922 translation excluded and changed several points about this passage in an attempt to transfer the meaning of the original text. We will be focusing on the parts were excluded over because of their suggested cultural features and from that we can determine the translating skills that he used.

The first line that Yang says after Ms. Jin's nurse came with her master's letter, “양소유 소저의 청안으로 돌아봄을 얻으니 죽도록 이 은덕을 어찌 잊으리오”, which directly translates as 'I am very much grateful that Ms. Jin likes me', is omitted in the English version. It is possible that he decided it was superfluous to the story, or that it adversely affected the readability of the story. Given the context however, the Korean text shows Ms. Jin as very outgoing and resourceful, or as someone who gets what she wants. This is important in the Korean version as it establishes a female character slightly outside the norm of Confucian society. It is a character who intrigues, even tempts, the main character on his journey.

The next line is “지금 한마디로 정할 것이니 화산의 길이 푸르고 위수 끊어지지 아니하였나이다”, which translates as 'swear it by the long green hills of Wha-san and the endless reaches of the Wee-soo River.' As you can see from the text, the verb swear is added to assist the audience who might be unfamiliar with the context being developed here. However, the phrase itself, 'the long green hills of Wha-san and the endless reaches of the Wee-soo River', suggests that he would never change his mind. The river and the hills mentioned here imply an unending, perpetual scenery, a metaphor for the resiliency of the character not to change his mind. In English, however, this implied structure is

removed, thereby making it necessary to add the more explicit “swear” to suggest the strength of his conviction.

One of the characteristics of Korean classical literature is that it contains poetry as dialogue and this novel is no exception. In this respect, the distinction between the original and the translation is the formation. In the Korean text it is visually clear that it is a poem based on its syntax and structure. However, Gale eschewed this structural integrity by writing these poetic stanzas as simple dialogue. However, Gale's translation also makes it clear that these are rhyming stanzas of dialogue. It shows that he understood the expressive characteristics as Reiss argued (1977) about focusing on aesthetic form. Yet, Gale chose to forego aesthetic fidelity for readability. Translating Korean poetry is difficult because it goes through two stages of translation; which are Chinese characters to Korean and Korean to English (Yim, 2012). Since we can't determine the source text that Gale used, it is difficult to ascertain whether the aesthetic fidelity was lost based on Gale's translation strategy or whether that had been removed from the source text that Gale was using. In short, it is difficult to determine whether he was translating from Chinese to English or from Korean to English; regardless, somewhere in this mix of translations the aesthetic fidelity in this poetry was lost.

In regards to content, because poems include many metaphorical expressions, the translation seems to have limitations in delivering the comprehensive meaning. It is much simpler than the original. Moreover there are some cultural implications that weren't carried over into the English translation, such as “장대 길” being translated into ‘draws his whip and rides again.’ Yang is specifically referring to 장대 길 as meaning that he is on his way to the palace of Jin to take a state examination but in the English version it is

missing. This is a detail of critical importance to the overall structure of the story as it demonstrates Yang as a well-read scholar, and an ambitious and potential state official. It positions him within the structure of Korean society in a position well suited to address the tensions between Buddhist and Confucian ideologies on action and morality.

Next is “원컨대 달 아래 노끈을 만들어 봄소식을 전하고자 하노라” which is translated as “ever may they bind us true, you to me, and me to you.” 노끈 in Korean culture implies that he proposed to her but the English version doesn't quite give the same impression. The “bind us true” in English does suggest a pact of strong emotional significance, but stops short of mentioning a full and formal proposal of marriage.

Through the analysis of this passage we find that Gale tried to focus on a target oriented translation. He omitted dense, metaphorically-laden text rather than adding a footnote to every. This was a decision born of pragmatism as much as fidelity as Gale was aware that the English audience would have less appreciation of these cultural features than was necessary to fully comprehend them. He was also aware that this was a work of literature and the structure when translated into English should reflect that.

Passage #3

정신이 멍하여 오랜 후에 비로소 제 몸이 연화도장 성진 행자인 줄 알고
생각하니, 처음에 스승의 책망을 듣고 풍도로 가고 인간 세상에 환생하여 양 씨
지의 아들이 되어 장원 급제 한림학사를 하고 출장입상하여 공을 이루고
벼슬에서 물러나 두 공주와 여섯 남자와 같이 즐기던 것이 다 하룻밤 꿈이라.
마음으로 생각해되,

‘이 분명 사부께서 내 생각의 그릇됨을 알고 꿈을 꾸게 하여 인간 세상 부귀와
남녀 간 정욕이 다 허사인 줄 알게 함이로다’ (2003, p. 230-231)

Target Text: His mind and soul were hopelessly confused and his heart beat with
trepidation. 부가정보 He suddenly awakened and said: "I am Song-jin, a priest of
Yon-wha Monastery." 대사처리

As he thought over the past he remembered how he had been reprimanded and
what had followed. He recalled his flight to Hades and how he had transmigrated
into human life; how he had become a clansman of the Yang family; his passing
the [p297] examination and becoming a high Hallim; his promotion to the rank of
General, and later to be the head of the entire official service; how he had
memorialized the Emperor to resign his office; his retirement with the two
Princesses and the six ladies how he had enjoyed music and dancing and the notes
of the harp and lute; how he had drunk wine and played at go, and had lived his
days in pleasure. Now it was all as a passing dream.

Then he said: "The Teacher indeed, knowing my great sin, sent me forth to dream
this dream of life so that I might learn the fleeting character and instability of all
earthly things and the vainloves of human kind" (p 130).

This passage is the last part of the story where the main character is realizing what has happened in this dream and what changes this has brought about in him. We have analyzed this passage through three conventions. The first convention is related to maintaining the atmosphere. The second convention is about the cultural material. The third convention is the translation strategies that Gale employed.

To start from the passage “He suddenly awakened and said: "I am Song-jin, a priest of Yon-wha Monastery." we can see that the sentence was changed from an assertive sentence in the source text into passive lines in the target text. This change may clarify the main character’s state so as to help readers understand his situation. However, this suddenness is structurally awkward, and not matching with the flow of the text. It damages the classic’s original structure, which generally consisted of long, flowing sentences. Furthermore, after “What had followed”, the translator arranged events in a chronological sequence. This may improve the readability of the action of the story but it adversely affects the elaborate style of the original.

The second part is about the cultural conventions. By way of background as to what makes *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* significant in the world of Korean literature, it is important to remember that this work includes three important Asian philosophies—Buddhism, Confucianism and Taoism. However, through the translation process, the crucial parts that contain the philosophical meaning are omitted or not fully contextualized so that readers are not given sufficient context to identify where Buddhism, Confucianism and Taoism appear in the translated version. We believe it is the translator’s responsibility to provide contextual and background information on Asian culture and religion, at least briefly, to allow readers to fully access and appreciate *The*

Cloud Dream of the Nine. If not, the reader may not identify or comprehend the reality-dream-reality format of the story or the overall nuance of Asian cultural content.

From the ‘He recalled his flight to Hades and how he had transmigrated into human life’ passage, this translation does not fully explain the concept of the Buddhist ‘Hwansaeng’, omitting the information that while he had transmigrated into a human life, he was reborn as a totally different person but with the same soul. This is an example of where a translated cultural context would have provided the reader the ability to appreciate this cultural detail. It also is a structural issue as it is important to the main character that he retains his soul in order to illustrate the Buddhist context as well as the learning process that occurs over the entire story.

From “his passing the examination and becoming a high Hallim” passage, Gale chose to omit an explanation of what Hallim is, an omission that we feel is necessary for a sound appreciation of the story. Even though there is a brief explanation about ‘Hallim’ (p. 33)– “was recorded a hallim, a master of literary rank” and in the commentary (p. 73)– the term Hallim means a member of the college of literature, a literary senator. The translation does not provide sufficient information about how great a social position that Hallim was and how great a life Song-jin had lived. A literary senator is indeed structurally accurate but not suggest the grandeur and prestige that the position holds in Korean Confucian society. Also, when readers read “his promotion to the rank of General, and later to be the head of the entire official service”, they may have no idea that it is related to Confucianism. Therefore, the translator should provide the importance of taking a high social position in Confucianism to the readers. It is this movement between

Buddhist and Confucian traditions that forms the foundation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* and, as such, it is necessary for the translation to contextualize those movements.

The last point is about translation strategies. Among various translation strategies, domestication and foreignization can be seen in Gale's work. Domestication refers to source-language items being translated as target-language items so that they conform to target-language norms (Venuti, 1995). Foreignization is the opposite procedure, whereby such items are not adapted in this way but are borrowed or transferred directly (Chesterman & Wanger, 2002). In the passage "how he had enjoyed music and dancing and the notes of the harp and lute", 'harp and lute' didn't exist as such in the Chosun Dynasty (but indigenous Korean, nominally related instruments did). Also, from the line 'how he had drunk wine', 'wine' didn't exist in the way that the English word suggests. There is a Korean traditional alcohol that is being served here that demands a more detailed term than wine. These are assumed to be the result of cultural filtering. On the other hand, from the line "and played at go", foreignization has been used. Since readers may not know what the ancient Asian game of 'go' is, Gale should have explained the concept of 'go' briefly in the text or commentary. From 'instability of all earthly things and the vain loves of human kind" (p 130)' passage, an implied meaning was used in the phrase "vain loves". The expression 'lust' is better than 'vain loves'. It is because it has to include a sexual context. As we can see from the story, the expression 'vain love' is vague. In this part, the translator shouldn't have used an implied to deliver the original meaning as it negated the sexual context of the exchange.

The origin of the source text of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* is still a controversial issue. Whether the original text was written in Chinese characters or in

Korean is still unknown. A variety of modern Korean translation versions exist.

Therefore, it is difficult to define which version Gale had selected as a source text. For these reasons, compared to contemporary Korean literature, it is especially difficult to analyze the English translation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* in terms of its fidelity to the source text. However, we believe that classical literature should maintain its classical structure. Since *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* is a literary work, it should be translated as close to the original work as possible in terms of its aesthetics, structure, and nuance.

With this in mind, we believe that Gale's 1922 translation deserves a thorough analysis with an eye towards subsequent translations capturing the complexity of Korean classical literature.

Conclusion

In this paper, we have attempted to demonstrate that the 1922 Gale translation of *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*, a highly revered piece of Korean classical literature originally written Kim Man-chung in 1687, was a respectful and necessary work. It brought this Korean classic to an English audience at a time when very little Korean literature, particularly classical literature, was available. We have demonstrated that Gale produced an admirable effort, a translation that captured the plot structures of the complex original while maintaining high readability for a non-Korean audience. It has remained, arguably, the best English translation available.

The three passages presented comparing the 2003 Korean version and the Gale translation attempt to demonstrate the translation methods being used by Gale and the quality of the overall translation. In these passages, we demonstrated that Gale's adherence to readability inherently limited the capacity of the translation to present the

cultural specificity of the source work. *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* (1687) is a sophisticated moral, ethical, and culturally specific work outlining the journey of a high Korean official through a Buddhist and Confucian dream-like metaphorical state. That structure bears the hallmarks of its inherent Chinese influence (Li & Xiu-li, 2005). It is, as well, a comparative and highly imaginative study of religions, governing orders, and the role of the conscientious individual amidst these environments (Bantly, 1996). Gale's translation, while faithful to readability, doesn't comprehensively present a context where these machinations are visible: the religious movements, the social structures, the Chinese influences, and the nuances of words and phrases. Gale as much admitted this through Scott's foreward to his 1922 translation: "His thoughts are on a faithful interpretation of the Far Eastern mind and Far Eastern manners rather than on those felicities of word and phrase with which literary reputations are sought" (Scott in Gale, 1922). We believe this strategy was a sound one for 1922; in 2014 we believe reading audiences to be sophisticated and versed enough in Korean tradition and culture to appreciate a more sophisticated translation. More than anything, we believe in the fidelity of the form. Since *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* is a classic literary text in the original, the cultural and structural details that make it a classic literary work should be reflected in the translation.

We recommend a new effort to translate *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* into English using the cultural and structural details that Gale omitted. A new translation with a faithful representation of the sophisticated classical literary structure and its Chinese influence, the nuanced Korean cultural presentation of meaning, and the movements between Buddhist and Confucian traditions would increase the depth of the translation for

English audiences and begin to demonstrate the richness of the original *The Cloud Dream of the Nine* by Kim Man-chung (1687). We believe English audiences are sophisticated enough to embrace such a translation.

Bibliography

Baek, E. J. (1993). The Korean Mind Reflected in James Scarth Gale's Early Writings.

Bantly, F. C. (1996). *Embracing illusion: truth and fiction in The dream of the nine clouds*. SUNY Press.

Bao-long, L. I. (2005). The Chinese Influence on the Korean Ancient Ghost Stories——An Analysis of Mrs. Sa's Conquest to the South, Nine Cloud Dream and Jaded Mansion Dream. *Journal of Yanbian University (Social Sciences Edition)*, 3, 006.

Braesel, S. (2002). Karl Friedrich August Guetzlaff-The First German in Korea. *Transactions of the Royal Asiatic Society, Korea Branch*, 77.

Chesterman, A. & Wagner, E. (2002). *Can Theory Help Translators: A Dialogue Between The Ivory Tower And The Wordface (Translation Theories Explained)*. St Jerome Publishing,: Manchester.

Gale, J. S. (2008). *Korean Folk Tales: Imps, Ghosts and Fairies*. Holmes Press.

Gale, J. S. (1918). Korean Literature. *The Open Court*, 1918(2), 3.

Gale, J. S. (1912). The Korean Alphabet. *Transactions of the Korea Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 4 (Part 1).

Gale, J. S. (1912). Korea's Preparation for the Bible. *Korea Mission Field*. Jones, GH (1910). *Korea mission*. New York: *The BFM of the MEC*.

Gale, J. S. (1900). The Influence of China upon Korea. *Transactions of the Korea Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 1, 1-24.

Gale, J. S. (1898). *Korean sketches*. New York: Young People's Missionary Movement of the United States and Canada; Chicago: FH Revell; Toronto: W. Briggs.

Gale, J. S., & Rutt, R. (1927). *History of the Korean People*. Christian Literature Society of Korea.

Gale, J. S., Kim, M. S., Ha, T. H., & Ko, Y. G. (1894). *Korean grammatical forms* (Vol. 4). T'ap Ch'ulp'ansa.

Gale, J. S., Underwood, H. & Hulbert, H. B. (1890). *A concise dictionary of the Korean language: in two parts, Korean-English & English-Korean*. Kelly & Walsh.

Jones, G.H. (1892). *Studies in Korean Etymology*.

Gale, J. S., Kim, M. S., Ha, T. H., & Ko, Y. G. (1894). *Korean grammatical forms* (Vol. 4). T'ap Ch'ulp'ansa.

Gützlaff, K. F. A (1833). *On the Corean Language*.

Gützlaff, K. F. A., Kim, M. S., Ha, T. H., & Ko, Y. G. (1979). *Remarks on the Corean language*. T'ap Ch'ulp'ansa.

Hulbert, H. (1892). *The Korean Alphabet*.

Kang, S. J. (2012). Protestant Influence on Korean Education Development. In *International Handbook of Protestant Education* (p. 537-551). Springer Netherlands.

Kim, M.J. (2003). *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*. Minumsa: Seoul.

Kim, M.J. (1922). *The Cloud Dream of the Nine*, translated by James S. Gale, with introduction by E. K. Robertson Scott. London. (L. RAS. U.)

King, R. (2004). Western Protestant missionaries and the origins of Korean language modernization. *Journal of International and Area Studies*, 11(3), 7-38.

Kwak, T. H., & Joo, S. H. (Eds.). (2003). *The Korean peace process and the four powers*. Ashgate Publishing, Ltd..

Li, W. & Xiu-li, J. (2005). The Influence of Chinese Literature on Korean Novels From Dream of Nine Clouds. *Journal of Zhangjiakou Teachers College*, 2: 006.

McGreal, I. P. (1996). *Great literature of the Eastern World: the major works of prose, poetry and drama from China, India, Japan, Korea and the Middle East*. HarperCollins.

Rutt, R. trans. 1974 "A Nine Cloud Dream." *Virtuous Women: Three Classic Korean Novels*. Seoul: Kwang Myong Printing Co.

Silva, D. J. (2002). Western attitudes toward the Korean language: an overview of late nineteenth-and early twentieth-century mission literature. *Korean studies*, 26(2), 270-286.

Underwood, H. H. *Korean Literature in English: A Critical Bibliography*.

Underwood, H. H. (1931). Occidental literature on Korea. *Transactions of the Korea Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society*, 20, 1-185.

Venuti, L. (1995). *The Translator's Invisibility*. New York: Routledge

Yi, I.S. (1892). *The Alphabet (Pancul)*.

Yun, C. S. (1981). The Structure of the Kuun mong [A dream of nine clouds]. *Korean Studies*, 5(1), 27-41.